



5th Global Review of Aid for Trade

Informal Reporting by CUTS

Aid for Trade is was initially launched in 2005 at the Hong Kong Ministerial Conference with the aim of aiding developing and least developed countries to trade efficiently. In 2006, the WTO established a Task Force to bring the focus of Aid for Trade particularly on identifying and responding to the needs of recipient countries and donors. A monitoring body was set up under the WTO to take a periodic review of the Aid for Trade Initiative; The Global Review of Aid for Trade.

The purpose of the Global Review is to monitor and evaluate Aid for Trade and provide incentives in advancing the Aid for Trade agenda for donors and recipients. 2015 Marks the 5th Global Review session, with the theme of “Reducing Trade Costs for Inclusive, Sustainable Growth.” This session took an in depth analysis at the issues and impacts of trade costs and examined how Aid for Trade can play a role in promoting inclusive, sustainable growth by taking measures to reduce trade costs. The panellists and attendees were made up of country representatives, government and non government officials, organizations, private sector firm heads, small enterprise representatives, and more.

The Consumer Unity and Trust Society (CUTS) International, in Geneva was one of the attendees and event organizers at the 5th Global Review of Aid for Trade. CUTS International is a nongovernmental organization (NGO) involved in issues such as: supporting the global south in multilateral trade, analyzing policy linkages, facilitating developing countries in policy making, and supporting regulatory reforms. Based on their participation, CUTS International staff members compiled the following reports. It should be noted that CUTS reports cannot be considered official, which is the prerogative and responsibility of the organizers behind the respective events. Hence, these reports by CUTS staff should not be quoted and the organizations responsible for the events should be contacted directly for clarifications and further information.

PLENARY SESSIONS

Day 1: Tuesday, 30 June

Plenary Session 2: Supporting Implementation of the Trade Facilitation Agreement

By Leslie Debornes

The WTO's Trade Facilitation Agreement (TFA) contains a variety of measures to expedite the movement, release and clearance of goods. The measures of the TFA bind WTO members to increasing transparency, implementing streamlined and updated border control procedures and improving governance through disciplines on decision making processes. There are a range of economic studies that suggest the TFA will have important effects on reducing trade costs and accruing savings to developing countries.

Commitments for custom and border modernization support for the Organization for Economic Co operation and Development (OECD) reached around US\$667 million in 2013. A further US\$1.9 billion has been disbursed for trade facilitation assistance from 2006 2013. This session analyzes and explores the achievements of this support and the lessons learned from TFA implementation, particularly for the operation of the WTO's TFA Facility.

Moderator: Anabel Gonzalez, Senior Director, Global Practice on Trade and Competitiveness, World Bank Group

Panel Discussion:

- Shamshad Akhtar: Executive Secretary, United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific
- Marcus Cornaro: Deputy Director General, Directorate General for International Cooperation and Development, European Commission
- Gilbert Langat: Chief Executive Officer, Shippers Council for East Africa
- Paul Steele: Senior Vice President, International Air Transport Association
- Kunio Mikuriya: Secretary General, World Customs Organization
- Eric G. Postel: Associate Administrator, United States Agency for International Development
- Alioune Sarr: Minister of Trade, Informal Sector, Consumption, Promotion of Local Products and SME, Senegal
- Thomas Silberhorn: Parliamentary State Secretary, Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development, Germany
- Desmond Swayne: Minister of State, Department for International Development, United Kingdom

Session's Main Points:

- Asia Pacific region is doing well in the implementation of the TFA. Majority have implemented well over 2 or 3 of the measures. 1) Promoting single windows further 2) authorize economic operator's programme, to be work on. Level of implementation not necessarily linked to level of development (i.e. Cambodia). We can expect reduction of trade costs by the implementation of TFA. Full implementation of TFA would lead to a 16 or 17% reduction on trade costs on average in the region.
- EAC: issue of documentation is a major issue in EAC. Export and import procedures are one of the main causes for that. Lack of understanding of these procedures. Need to have information flow. Number of implementing agencies involved in the TFA: permit, license, etc. one of the major issue.
- Recommend to standardize necessary information and remove internal control and bring businesses on board to improve their compliance
- TFA provides many tools; to implement the TFA is it necessary to do it in a harmonized manner using the WTO tools. Political will and people mindset has changed and more partnerships with donors, this is the way for sustainable aid for trade
- Involve stakeholders in the detailed project make it a collaborative effort – runs M&E towards the start to spot where the thing is not delivering from the outset: key things to delivering value for money
- UK or EU commission: key donors in supporting TFA implementation. Help countries implement the aid for trade agreement, because of the huge benefit that will accrue to the world economy. It will make a huge difference to developing countries.
- Has to be a strong collaboration between the government and the PS, the WCO, the ICC, etc. tangible collaborative solutions.
- Other regions:
 - West Africa: Senegal: TF is critical for regional integration in West Africa harmonization of rules and mechanisms. Trade in services: in modifying the rules and laws, Senegal has x20 its turnover of the telecommunication sector and increases the revenues for bank.
 - Implementing the TFA increase the regional integration. To be connect to the GVC, entering the GVC by entering or enhancing the regional value chains. Accelerate regional integration to put value added in our production or value chain
 - Advance other critical part of the negotiations in Bali (cotton for instance) to support the TFA, to have a coherent economy framework
 - Germany supports ECOWAS trade liberalization scheme – establishment of a free trade area, and not integrate new member state in this market. Provide experience and technical assistance on how to meet quality standards. Cooperate both at regional and bilateral levels. Facilitation of trade has an impact of investment too, it is a factor of competitiveness in the all range of economic cooperation.
 - Germany is the major EU donor on aid for trade and TF. Increase the present commitment about 5 billion dollars. Need holistic perspective on the trading system taking into account the GVC take into account the framework of regional integration to create new regional value chains are better than ways to integrate developing countries into the GVCs. Require the collaboration with the PS and increase awareness of the PS or companies. Strive to ratify and implement the TFA better cooperate with PS to have these measures on the ground
 - Ministre sénégalais: L'Afrique doit ratifier rapidement cet accord, pour connecter les petites et moyennes entreprises aux chaînes de valeur mondiales dans les produits intermédiaires

et services. Segments rentables de l'économie mondiale pour éradiquer la pauvreté dans nos pays.

Day 2: Wednesday, 1 July

Plenary Session 10: Reducing Trade Costs in South South Trade

Leslie Debornes

South South cooperation is an emerging area in the Aid for Trade landscape. South South trade focuses greatly on infrastructure development and upgrading; a constraint that is consistently ranked the highest limiting factors in global trade participation by developing countries. This session aims to examine and explore the opportunities South South trade offers for economic transformation in the context of the UN's emerging Post 2015 Development Agenda and how action to address high trade costs can help promote this economic opportunity.

Moderator: Shishir Priyadarshi, Director, Development Division, World Trade Organization

Panel Discussion:

- Alejandro Gamboa Castilla : Director General, Presidential Agency for International
- Alhaji Usman Boie Kamara : Minister of Trade and Industry, Sierra Leone
- Pranav Kumar : Head, International Trade Policy, Confederation of Indian Industry
- Saidrahmon Nazriev: First Deputy Minister for Economic Development and Trade, Tajikistan
- Syed Tauqir Shah: Ambassador, Permanent Representative to the WTO, Pakistan
- Jianhua Yu: Ambassador, Permanent Representative to the WTO, People's Republic of China

Session's Main Points:

- 45% of the world trade. 70% for China global trade.
- Important to have common objective, and have a common strategy are better than Reduce trade costs and create new opportunities, provide assistance to other countries (i.e. China)
- Enhance trade capacity: medium and large infrastructure perspective, provide trade and finance, and promote free flows of goods and services
- Reduce trade costs: ensure TFA implementation, which will reduce trade costs, help LDCs to improve customs procedures
- Create trade opportunities: offer duty free treatment to LDCs and other developing countries.
- Need to mobilize more resources from dvt members and agencies. Support from private sector also.
- Provide north south trade through promoting south south trade and promoting SD or correlation between south south trade and dvt cooperation
- If dvt cooperation btw south south partner can lead to reduce trade costs it means that can led to an increasing of global trade
- Sierra Leone: importance of capacity building for infrastructure. LDCs portion of participation in global trade is less than 1%. All countries over the world participate in trade to increase the well

being of their people and to some extent to others. To reduce world poverty and deprivation of rights, terrorism, etc it is very important that the world pays attention to trade: trade is a getaway. South south trade , wild disparities within south south. In the south south situation the facilities are not even there in some cases: build infrastructures to make sure you take the opportunities. Need to be a massive rethink of the world trade order.

- How do we change that? For south south cooperation the willingness is there but the means are not there. Need to have facilities in place (infrastructure, energy, power...) to have them you need to invest. TF, target inset. You need to build capacity, for that you need money and skills or expertise.
- Productive capacity is better than the important of infrastructure to facilitate trade, and also regional integration. CAREG programme (central Asia): dvt and cooperation leading to accelerate economic growth and poverty reduction (TF, trade policy, energy). Cooperation in the field of transport. Implementation of 6 transport corridors: important for the entire region, connection. Involve a certain amount of stakeholders in the value chain along the corridor.
- Pakistan: renewable hydro energy will be transmitted by central Asia. Pakistan is one of the primary benefits of the CAREG? Project. Deepen the economic integration. Energy as a service coming to the region. Other project: pipeline of gaz. Bring more prosperity to the region and deeper integration. TAPI and CASA 1000 (check the names of the project). China – Pakistan economic corridor project: establish new trade and transport link between china and other Asian regions. Provide water link between these two corridors. Transport, highways, railways, boats, industrial zone, IT, data transfer, energy (renewable energy for the main part). Game changer for Pakistan and the region: link with china, central Asia and south Asia. Concerned 3 billion people, primary beneficiaries of this. Deepening of eco integration with low trade costs: open opportunities for better jobs for the poor. Set of 55 projects.
- DG of the presidential agency for cooperation agency in Colombia: work on reception of cooperation in the country, support from different donors, BUT on the same time working on the demand of diff region, and provide support and solutions. Working with partners for development. Value very much south, field to field exchange of knowledge. We want developed countries to be part of this knowledge exchange. Different programmes that include developed countries. Tools and mechanisms to exchange knowledge: 5 regional strategies (Central America, Caribbean, African, Asia). Partners: multilateral banks (build cases of good practices to exchange through channel or mechanism of the WB);
- Invite developed countries to trust those mechanisms: solution from practitioners to practitioners in other developing countries.
- Also have bilateral interactions
- Strengthening and promoting SMEs: design a strategy to promote entrepreneurship for SMEs are better than 7 in Central America and contribute to two policies in Honduras and Salvador (and a fund to promote entrepreneurship in Salvador)
- Bring people from different African countries (selected by their governments), and show them how we built strategies to promote SMEs and entrepreneurship. Third round of this initiative this year.

Plenary Session 13: Reducing Trade Costs for LDCs' Merchandise Trade Development

By Leslie Debornes

Export and border procedures, as well as infrastructure for transport are commonly identified as the most prominent sources of trade costs for the export of goods by all the least developed countries that replied to the 2015 Aid for Trade self assessment monitoring questionnaire. In comparison to other WTO members, it is clear that LDCs face a comparative disadvantage in regards to the cost of exporting goods. Furthermore, transport bottlenecks and some non tariff measures act as additional obstacles to LDCs in entering value chains. This session examines trade costs in LDCs from the view of the Bali 2013 Trade Facilitation Agreement. Bali decisions are examined and issues that constrain producers and investors are identified as well.

Moderator: Robert de Kock: Secretary General, World Federation of the Sporting Goods Industry

Panel Discussion:

- Marten van den Berg: Vice Minister for Foreign Economic Relations, Netherlands
- Jude Hervey Day: Minister of Industry and Trade, Haiti
- Celestin Monga: Managing Director, United Nations Industrial Development Organization
- Phouvieng Phongsa: Deputy Director General, Planning and Cooperation Department, Ministry of Industry and Commerce, Lao People's Democratic Republic
- Joshua Setipa: Minister of Trade and Industry, Lesotho
- Jeffrey Whalen: Senior Counsel, Customs and International Trade, Nike Inc.

Session's main points :

- Nike: strong enforcement of IP law and strong protection for investment, challenge of getting enough labour or staff
- Lesotho: landlocked country or challenge, make the transaction costs very high. Labour conditions, working condition: subscribe to ILO conventions, compliance regime. Mitigate the structural challenges look how to benchmark ourselves the best. Where make further progress: scaling up investments in productivity.
- Cambodia: DTIS has been supported by EIF, updated to deal with the changing landscape of trade policy at regional level. Challenges or roadmap: lack of leadership, infrastructure and logistics, HR and expertise to support the infrastructure and skills and technical knowledge, and a skill labour force capable to absorb the skills and investment legal framework, transport network, public services, lack of coordination and public and private finance much are lacking and provide a conducive environment to existing and future environment
- TF and integration of ICT into business processes. Certification of origin application can be made online now.
- UNIDO: the dvt business has made a lot of mistakes i.e. advise developing countries to get involved in too many industries in which they have no comparative advantage. Need to make sure your PS think it is a sector with potential
- Dutch aid for trade policy: better investment and better business (OECD guidelines, bilateral consultations support of PS,
- Lack of killed labour, because of the growing demand of Thai that absorb some of our market into Thailand. Laos

- The market access issue: teams investigate studies on preferential treatment we have with other countries (Cambodia).
- Lesotho: on market access as LDC we have preferential market access with key countries. Market access is not an issue. Challenges that we have is on TF, efficiency on custom, important movement of goods, costs of transport, delays RoO issues exist on some markets: that undermine the capacity to fully utilize the market access opportunity. Require investment in skills to all related services upon costumes, migration ... that will be able to address challenges. Transparency and legal framework to be improved.
- Nike: transparency, predictability, fairness ... TFA will provide a great opportunity to pull many things together. In terms of market access: issue of protectionism, issue of RoO, import costs and delays, consistency of the rules,
- Policies to benefit industries to export and enter the foreign markets
- Issue of RoO is very complicated, especially in the context of VCs.
- Issue of market access, UNIDO access to market: how do we help economies prepare to be ready to sell goods that meet the test of the international market.
- Need to be very selective and identify the sectors with the PS in which you have potential.

Plenary Session 14: Reducing Trade Costs for LDCs' services trade development

By Leslie Debornes

Significant research has been done to illustrate that customary market access to barriers, as well as issues with network infrastructure and domestic regulation act as significant trade costs for service suppliers. This session highlights the opportunities for LDCs in commercial services markets by increasing supply side capacity and addressing barriers and challenges to trade. Some key challenges and solutions specific to trade facilitation will be explored to advance sustainable development objectives.

Moderator: Gyan C. Acharya, UN Under Secretary General and High Representative for the Least developed Countries, Landlocked Developing Countries and Small Island Developing States

Panel Discussion:

- Bernard Hoekman : Professor, Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies, European University Institute
- Rogers Karebi: Secretary General and Founding Member, Uganda BPO Association
- Darlington Mwape: Ambassador and Senior Fellow, ICTSD
- Myat Su: Businesswoman, Silk Road to Asia Travels and Tours Company Ltd, Myanmar

Session's Main Points:

- Defining SDGs, why services matter. Not explicitly mention except health and education, but means to achieve these goals. Operational zing these goals.

- Huge disconnect between output of production and trade, different channels than trade in goods (i.e. Through FDI). FDI in service: Channel for knowledge, employing, improving skills, tech transfer.
- Policy implication: policy is a lot less supportive for trade in services than for trade in goods, hence costs are higher. Barriers are much higher for services. High in certain sectors in particular, sectors where LDCs have a comparative advantage for. Issues relating to adjustability to get to a market or
- Institutional barriers and infrastructure barriers
- Government comes up with laws to support the industry (Uganda). Political stability. Infrastructure (incubation centre? new mechanism or committee put in place by the government? Engaging PS players).
- Potential: job creation, income generation,
- Challenges: very high cost in doing business, internet in the region is the highest cost, insufficiency supporting regulation (data protection is yet to be passed), government is very reluctant when it comes to outsourcing (need to start outsourcing locally), the investment climate is not yet conducive enough to attract national and international investment, string taxation policy by Uganda government, access to market is a big challenge.
- Way forward: incubation centre, commitment to set up an ICT pack from the government, partnership with a government agency to promote services or market services, current partnership with ITC that help us create capacities being ourselves and help us access cheap finance for instance
- Les services ont un impact direct sur la croissance économique du pays. Pays africains doivent montrer plus d'attention à leur secteur des services. Secteur avec un taux de croissance avec plus de 20%. On n'évoque pas assez les services à la personne, souvent fait par des femmes, et qui produisent BCP au PIB, pas suffisamment estimé. AfT doit porter une attention particulière à ce type de services : plus de protection sociale, femmes exposés, fiscalité adaptée... politique de développement de télécommunications mis en place au Sénégal : 3 compagnies de télécommunication, 1ère compagne a multiplié par 25 son chiffre d'affaires – ils ont commencé par construction de fibre optique and loi sur la société de l'info (vision de dvt de télécommunication) and loi sur cybercriminalité. Avoir un environnement qui donne de l'espace mais également un cadre. Pbl de financement dans la chaîne de valeur : fonds de garantie prioritaire (50% pris en charge par l'Etat quand la jeune etps veut investir, et 50% par secteur privé).
- Barriers in services are particularly in policy and regulatory. What reforms to affect growth of services trade? Liberalization alone is not sufficient. Market access alone is not necessary to spur trade growth in LDCs. Important to take those considerations into account when agreeing on a services' waiver, granting a service' waiver.
- Which policies or reforms? Require both from the origin and the destination of the service. Issue of visa application for instance. Not just about requiring a visa but also the structure of the administration of the visa granting process.
- 1st step is to identify the priority services sector, which are the priority sectors and now look at analytically and look at what are the barriers that need to be addressed. Come up with recommended regulation reforms or policy reform. This work will require AfT finance !!! Need to have support to identify where the barriers are and reform our policy or regular reform.
- Myanmar: Tourism as political priority focus on eco tourism and culture tourism or community based tourism. Lot of challenges : shortage of competent and skilled labour and training

programme for managers as well and quality of infrastructure and electricity and water supply are not adequate yet and shortage of hotel rooms and highly price for the quality and information and technological technology and political stability and dependent on foreign currency and access to finance – keep changing the rate of policy (banks) and policy regulation : complexity on taxation, double taxation

Day 3: Thursday, 2 July

Plenary Session 16: Trade and Gender: Empowering Women through Inclusive Value Chains

By Sidra Amiri

Empowering women through inclusive supply chains is important as it makes economic sense and social sense. Economically, women constitute half of the population; foregoing their potential and abilities will never allow a country to reach sustainable development. Socially, women have higher propensity to use their earnings and power to purchase products that improve the health, nutrition, and education of their families. This creates a virtuous cycle; female spending develops human capital, which in turn fuels economic growth. This session addressed four key issues: (i) The importance of integrating women into value chains, (ii) Key drivers, (iii) Key challenges, and (iv) Actions Aid for Trade can do.

Paivi Kairamo, Ambassador, Permanent Representative to the WTO, Finland started the discussion off by providing three crucial points from Finland's experience with regards to trade and development. (i) Firstly, that trade is necessary for sustainable development. (ii) That Gender equality is critical for economic development, and finally that (iii) Aid for trade matters.

Ambassador Kairamo states that “no country can reach its full potential until women can attain their full potential.” Finland has produced a study on gender equality, global value chains and the role of Aid for Trade. As findings from the study, Ambassador Kairamo pointed out that international trade has increased employment of women and has allowed more women to work in GVC companies. This has provided the women with better salaries and working conditions than domestic jobs. Despite this improvement, however, trade cannot fix all the problems; it can only create and strengthen the foundations for improving gender equality. Much of the benefits of trade related development depend on policy, social traditions, and culture. Trade policy has a role to play in that it is important to improve market access and take down trade barriers. Harassment at borders is a key impediment in integrating women in trade related activities. This can be helped by capacity building and assuring that formalities are applied in a neutral manner.

Corporations can make a difference as well; they can include gender equality in their business principles. It is important that they comply with International initiatives; as outlined in the OECD Guidelines.

In conclusion, Paivi stated that empowering women is good for business, good for poverty reduction, for sustainability; it is good for men.

The next speaker on the panel was Ambassador Pamela Hamamoto; the permanent representative of the United States to the UN and other International Organizations in Geneva. Ambassador Pamela began by speaking about reducing trade costs, and their effects on women run businesses, stating that trade costs provide the biggest challenge to small and medium enterprises (SMEs). Since most of the women run businesses are (SMEs), reducing trade costs can be highly effective in empowering

women in the economy. Despite the fact that 1 or 3rd of SMEs are owned by women, globally, women are more economically excluded than men. There are some things already being done to improve this situation: Legal frameworks that constrain women activity are being reformed, public private partnerships are being created, and work is being done to increase women's rights to ownership, credit, and market data, and accessibility to technology and e-commerce knowledge. Looking towards the future, there are a few other measures that can be put into place to promote women development into sustainable supply chains.

For example, it is vital that women owned businesses be allowed to export their products; this will make them more successful. Women firms that export tend to employ five times more people, have average sales and revenue higher than those who don't.

Other steps to integrate women into supply chains are through mentoring and networking. The World Bank group found that mentoring support increases SMEs effectiveness. In South Africa, for example, it can be seen that participants in programs with mentoring and training schemes end up having an increase in sales, employees, and customers. Male role models are important as well. It was found that in Uganda in 2013, women who had male role models were 55-74% more likely to cross over to higher productivity business sectors.

Ambassador Hamamoto launched an initiative called the "Future she Deserves" with the goal of leveraging business to protect and empower women and girls. Another initiative launched was the "Geneva Gender Champion"; to create a leadership network committed to enhancing women leadership and gender equality.

In conclusion, Ambassador Hamamoto stated that women are not just beneficiaries of programmes and this is not just about women's participation in supply chains. Gender equality and economic growth goes hand in hand. This is about women as agents for change, and full contributors to the sustainable development of our world.

The next speaker on the panel was Axel Marcel Addy, the Minister of Commerce and Industry in Liberia. Axel Marcel presents the Liberian government's focus on how governance and policy making can promote women entrepreneurship. He believes it is the responsibility of the ministry of commerce to promote an entrepreneur culture that enables women to feed themselves. Marcel brings forth the importance of investing in SMEs with a belief that that SMEs lead to inclusive growth. Last December the government of Liberia passed a law, which states that twenty five per cent of government's budget and services will be invested in SMEs, out of which five per cent will go towards women entrepreneurs. Marcel further states that there is a "need to work with entrepreneurs born and made". According to Marcel, aid for trade agenda is critical for unlocking women's potential in Africa. Along with encouraging investments in SMEs, Marcel mentioned how private sector could empower women and transform Africa. In conclusion, Marcel emphasised on how transparent and non-discriminatory trade rules can empower SMEs and therefore women in SMEs.

Archana Bhatnagar, the Managing Director of Haylide Chemicals and the President of Madhya Pradesh's women entrepreneurs in Jabalpur, India discusses the various challenges faced by women entrepreneurs. Describing how she started her business of green chemicals thirty five years ago with only \$10, Archana believes that when you support a women entrepreneur you support all those working for her.

Emphasising the advantages of investing in women entrepreneurs Archana mentions how the lack of certification hinders empowerment of women in India. Furthermore, she discusses the three basic challenges faced by women entrepreneurs such as access to market, access to finance and access to technology. As solutions to such hindrances, Archana mentions how the Indian government is trying providing entrepreneurs with access to market through successful ways such as paying up to ninety per cent of airfares and booth rentals. She also states that the Indian government has slated 25 per cent of procurement mandatorily for the public sector to be from the SMEs. Unfortunately gender is not

seen as a separate entity in that 25 per cent, a factor that according to Archana fails to empower women.

Overall, Archana discusses the challenges faced by women entrepreneurs and urges governments to embrace change and focus on deep rooted gender issues. There is a need to move from pledges to actions in order to fully empower women in the industry.

The next speaker was the head of public policy and government relations, Google, Indonesia: Shinto Nugroho. According to Shinto, technology can empower women in many ways. Many SMEs run by women and employing women have problems on network, knowledge, and awareness on logistics. "GAPURA" is a program that provides a gateway for enhancing the capabilities of women in technology. Women entrepreneurs who use technology in their processes are most successful and 80% are able to expand and export.

GAPURA has a few tiers: (i) Firstly, many women don't even understand the concept of the "internet" GAPURA provides a community of women where they can collectively educate each other through peer to peer learning. (ii) Secondly, there is a need to expand women's business operations; the best way is to link them with entrepreneurs who are already successful. This can be done through webinars, and web conferences. By being together, they create their own supply chain, can help each other improve business models, and even hire one another for certain tasks. (iii) Thirdly, Pressures of child rearing often mean that women need flexibility with their working schedule. Technology allows for this as women can work from home and do not need to be too heavily involved in administrative processes; such as maintaining a warehouse. For example, there are scarf producers who sell totally online, and they sell to people in the US and Europe as well as their own neighbouring countries. In her scarf producing business, the owner employed 400 people from her own community because they were taught how to use technology to go global.

The government has helped greatly in this process by creating hubs which allow an environment for women to get together and have access to technology and materials which enhance their skills. Women learn how to get licenses, manage customs, create networks, and they share jobs.

In conclusion, Shinto Nugroho ended by saying that technology equalizes the society; higher internet penetration means higher women owned businesses with greater efficiency and scope.

The final speaker, Dr. Mayela Quesada, a coffee producer in Costa Rica spoke from her experiences as an SME and mentioned some restrictions; Being able to attend international events would allow them to have greater added value, however, this is not always possible due to high costs. Furthermore, acquiring certifications are very difficult, and not having them disallows them from joining many more profitable markets. There is also a need for funds designated at scientific and technological research, which they do not have. However, despite these restrictions, Dr. Quesada's coffee producing company has achieved much.

Dr. Quesada's company has become known as the best producer in the area of Costa Rica. Those that cooperate with her company feel that they belong to the company; and the company aims to enable their children to go to school and break down the chain of poverty.

According to Dr. Quesada, the healthiest way of achieving improvements is involving oneself into direct communication with Aid for Trade. It is important for the government to allow more enterprises to reach their potential by decreasing tax burdens, and enabling them in the process of getting certifications. Furthermore, trade promotion institutions matter, and innovation is needed to move up the value chain.

Plenary session 17: Reducing Trade Costs and the Aid for Trade Results Agenda: Lessons from recent evaluations and Impact

Studies

By Rohan Unny Law

The aim of this panel is to debate different techniques of reducing trade costs in the Aid for Trade agenda. The panel shares key outcomes and lessons from recent research and impact assessments to outline how these inform programme strategy decisions. There is also reflection on lessons for how maximum value can be attained from large scale evaluations of Aid for Trade programmes.

Moderator: Tom Pengelly, Managing Director, Saana Consulting & Saana Institute

Panel Discussion:

- Bernardo Calzadilla Sarmiento: Director, Trade Capacity Building Branch, United Nations Industrial Development Organization
- Alex Thomas Ijjo: Research Fellow, Economic Policy Research Centre, Uganda
- Miguel Jimenez Pont : Head, Evaluation and Monitoring, International Trade Centre
- Melvin Spreij: Secretary, Standards and Trade Development Facility, World Trade Organization
- Annette Mutaawe Ssemuwemba: Deputy Chief Executive Officer, TradeMark East Africa
- Joaquim Tres: Integration and Trade Lead Specialist, Inter American Development Bank
- Daniela Zehentner Capell: Director, Trade related Development Cooperation, BMZ, Germany

Session's Main Points:

- Uptake is key and learning to do so is important for aid for trade to succeed.
- Evaluation are better than Learning are better than implementation are better than development.
- Engage with private sector and implement good business practices as well.
- Approach: (i) Identifying clear and measurable objective (results); (ii) Selecting indicators to measure progress; (iii) Setting explicit targets for each indicator; (iv) Monitoring result; (v) Reviewing and reporting results; (vi) Integrating evaluation to provide complementary performance information; (vii) Using performance information for accounting learning and decision making.
- Long term projects and those that are flexible throughout their lifetimes' are most effective.
- You can remove NTB, subsidies, etc. but you need to empower and increase competence, understanding, involvement, etc. □ inclusiveness, participation and learning.
- Accountability of donors to their taxpayers can be a problem. Thus, transparency, accountability is key. data, inclusion, reports, monitoring, etc.
- Handholding stakeholders and explaining the data to them (capacity building) is better than bringing someone in or sending a report that they may not necessarily understand anyway. This approach builds trust.

PARALLEL PLENARY SESSIONS

Day 1: 30 June, 2015

Parallel Plenary Session 4: The Role of Trade Facilitation in Supporting Africa's Regional Integration Agenda

By Sidra Amiri

Sessions' Main Points:

The objective of this session jointly Organized by the AU, the AfDB, and UNECA was to discuss how trade facilitation contributes to regional integration in Africa. There was a lot of discussion on the effects of establishing a Continental Free Trade Area (CFTA). Other avenues were explored as well, including: analyzing the roles of all stakeholders, empowering women in Africa, putting in place universal trade restrictions, enhancing predictability and transparency in trading, supporting land locked countries in transportation, and lowering the cost of trade transport in general. The aspect of establishing a CFTA to support landlocked countries is crucial as it allows them to gain reduced trade related costs, as acknowledged in the Vienna Programme of Action.

- *Fatima H. Acyl, Commissioner for Trade and Industry, African Union:* Women make up more than 50% of the population and in cross border trade; 85% are women. Improving the training, educating, and capacities of these women, and providing them with the avenues for facilitated trade has a huge impact on the next generations. (i.e. their children, and families). There needs to be a transformation of organizations, ex. Banks to solve the problem of low transparency and predictability.
- *Solomon Asamoah, Vice President, Infrastructure, Private Sector and Regional Integration, African Development Bank:* It is important to review the banking system; education and training need to be improved in the sense of quality. There needs to be better socioeconomic structure, higher education, roads, railroads, etc.
- *Alassane Diop, Chief Executive Officer, Dubai Ports World Dakar, Senegal:* **(i)** In terms of private sector financing, it is important to compare the before, during, and after progress of the investment project. **(ii)** Finance to SMEs and Women are crucial. Tackling the root causes of instability is importantor Attracting investment; continental free trade agreement or Infrastructure, and education.
- *Abdalla Hamdok, Chief Economist and Deputy Executive Secretary, United Nations Economic Commission for Africa:* **(i)** Trade costs and infrastructure are key determinants in ensuring the impacts of trade facilitation are reaped in individual countries. **(ii)** Liberalization of trade: Non trade barriers are key issues, more important than the tariffs. **(iii)** Competitiveness of a country relies on the ability of that country to reduce their trade costs. **(iv)** Trade in Africa is improving, and there is a great reason to be an optimist; 15 years ago, trade in Africa was less than 3%; today it is at 15%. **(v)** The rising labour cost in emerging economies like China would allow Africa to explore that niche. **(vi)** Africa needs to “get its act together” by improving education, infrastructure, and trade liberalization. **(vii)** Regional Integration Index: Tracks down outcomes, how pronouncements, declarations and treaties go down on national level.

- *Ahmed Hamid, Commissioner, Trade, Customs, Industry and Free Movement Department, Economic Community for West African States:* **(i)** There needs to be investment in diversifying the economy in terms of its goods and services. This will allow for more entrepreneurship, and more value chains; **(ii)** There is a need to make sure that added value in one area is felt across the whole value chain. So if costs are reduced in one production step, all the producers along that value chain must benefit from the reduction in some way; **(iii)** Transportation in Africa has been, over the past years, boosted by over 52.3%. The most significant rise has been the flow of investment; **(iv)** Women has more than proven their worth in African Countries; they should not be classified as a vulnerable sector. They comprise professors, managers, employees, doctors, etc. However, half of West Africa is landlocked; they (particularly women) need specific support; **(v)** There needs to be a transformation in our banking, loaning systems: Generally, business people get loans in Africa and can't do anything beyond that. Finance officials engage in high interest loans, and usury. This is "thuggery", unfair, and makes most people poor. African development need to address these high interest rate issues.
- *Hiroshi Kato, Vice President, Japan International Co operation Agency:* **(i)** The current concept of predictability is outdated; the landscape has changed now; **(ii)** What we need is predictability in terms of policies, programs and projects, not AID; **(ii)** Corridor Development is key: connecting countries is good for donors, governments, NGOs, etc; **(iii)** One country cannot survive when neighbouring countries are left destitute. It is impossible, so corridor development is not only key for regional development; but critical for any country to develop too. Governments need to address this and understand this issue in order to improve development; **(iv)** There are no guarantee success factors to ensuring development and regional integration through the facilitation of trade. From our experience in Asia, there are necessary conditions: Infrastructure, human resources private and public sector involvement. (SMEs, farmers, village entrepreneurs included.)
- *Alioune Sarr, Minister of Trade, Informal Sector, Consumption, Promotion of Local Products and SME, Senegal:* **(i)** Improving infrastructure; **(ii)** Implementing Trade regulations to reduce interfaces to bare minimum; **(iii)** Access to finance: mechanisms we put in place to facilitate that is key; **(iv)** We need political will. Barrier in corridors are an issue to development; **(v)** Development of the corridor is the individual countries' own development; **(vi)** Lobbying governments to get rid of unnecessary barriers is important.
- *Thomas Silberhorn, Parliamentary State Secretary, Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development, Germany:* **(i)** Banks should not be picking up other banks' slacks. Contribution of development banks is important, however, it should not consist of them taking up the slack of other banks; **(ii)** Providing visas to citizens is important to move talent across borders; **(iii)** Infrastructure and project preparation is key for development.
- *Hope Situmbeko, Aid for Trade Coordinator, Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa:* **(i)** It is important to link neighbouring countries to bring together, or cumulate their production; **(ii)** There needs to be a linking of regional economies with one another, while having these economies be even more efficiently linked with the rest of the world.; **(iv)** Key issues are: a. Are member states abiding by assigned programs to enable trade? There needs to be an assessment of each stakeholder's actions and progress. ; and b. There are a number of programmes implemented by COMESA that can ensure that we are getting the right impact from reducing trade costs. One example is the simplified trade facilitation regime for SMEs, already taking place in Rwanda, Malawi, Zambia, Uganda, and more; **(v)** Access to finance: COMESA Adjustment Facility; **(vi)** Women produces a lot; however they don't have the tools. How do they come together? How do they address banks? They need tools to allow them to do such things.

- *Hanna S. Tetteh, Minister of Foreign Affairs and Regional Integration, Ghana*: Example of the impact of reducing trade cost: Africa Trade Fund: The Honey value chain in Rwanda and Zambia. Linking SMEs to formal markets, export and domestic. How did we do it? Three important processes: **(i)** Diagnostic; what are the problems? Solutions? Monitor the progress. ; **(ii)** Capacity Building: How to improve productive Capacity? Work with NGOs, (Ex. SMV); **(iii)** How to upgrade skills, and training. Look beyond infrastructure; Human Resources are the most crucial asset.

PARALLEL SIDE EVENTS

Day 1: 30 June, 2015

Parallel Side event 2: Aid for Trade and Intra and Inter Regional Trade Cooperation in French speaking Countries

Organizers: Joint OIF CEEAF CEMAC ECOWAS

By Rohan Unny Law

Session's Main Points:

- Focusing on islands: smallness and remoteness prevents achieving economies of scale = needs to be helped along by international community.
- Minister from Samoa: Samoa now not LDC, graduated to developing country status. Wants to maintain LDC benefits to maintain development. Part of regional program to better pacific island and regional betterment. Want further partnership with private sector. Emphasis on multilateralism. Increase exports. They have a plan. Trade sector support plan that started in 2014. SVE still need access to trade for aid programs.
- Australia: is a strong supporter of aid for trade and pacific economic and social development. Wants to facilitate aid for trade in the region. They want to participate in the long term. Successes in mobile banking in the pacific, which came of out deregulation of the telecommunications sector.
- Central America: collectively development is more easily facilitated. Political will is key to moving forward – now it is there more than ever. Keep growing in exports but people lower down are not benefitting as much. Adding value up the value chain. Reductions in bureaucracy and stumbling blocks are important. 2 types of trade facilitation: 1; cameras at borders and RFID for trucks at borders (to streamline), electronic document transmission. 2; diversification and productivity improvements and high quality control, specialized employments (moving towards).
- Jamaica: non tariff measures still need to be addressed. Magnification of things affecting flow of goods if a country is small. Trade comes before aid. Aid is facilitated by trade. Market access has been had for a long time, market penetration is not as easy. Narrow production and export base and subsequent vulnerability are an issue. Goals included: increase infrastructure, connect

territories, facilitating trade expansion, issues of diversification, regional integration – free movement of goods and people, etc. Still a work in progress

- Secretariat of the Commonwealth: happy that the World Bank and other multilaterals are learning the vulnerability of small states. Aid for trade dispersed to LDCs was far higher than small states group. Aid for trade mostly focuses on goods. Addressing barriers to services requires more focus and impetus. Transportation and storage is predominantly what goods in Pacific are doing. Nuanced approach to smaller states. Average commonwealth country is approx. 1800 km away from nearest global market.

Parallel Side Event 3: Joining Forces to Reduce Trade Costs for Inclusive Sustainable Growth

Jointly organised by ITC OECD WEF

By Julien Grollier

This side event chaired by Shishir Priyadarshi, Director, Development Division, WTO, discussed ways to strengthen the dialogue between the private and public sector, and how private and public finance can best be used to promote private sector development and reduce trade costs, particularly for SMEs.

The panel was composed of Pedro Cruz (SAB Miller, Mozambique) ; Margaretha Drzeniek Hanoue (World Economic Forum) ; Marion Jansen (Lead Economist, ITC) ; and Brenda Killen (Deputy Director, OECD Development Co operation Directorate).

Session's Main Points:

- Ms. Drzeniek Hanoue provided insights from of the latest WEF Enabling Trade Index (ETI), which evaluates performance of 7 key factors of enabling trade in over 140 countries. Findings indicate that AfT flows go the most in need, i.e. the lowest in the index. Burundi was shown as a success story, having improved its ranking on the ETI thanks to AfT flows.
- AfT disbursements in ICT, Border infrastructure & administration seem to reap the most results and helps reduce trade costs.
- Main bottlenecks for businesses are: (i) Customs procedures for imports; (ii) cost of logistics services for exports (represent an entry cost); (iii) access to information on what they can export where and how; (iv) cost of business creation, i.e. average of 4000 USD first investment to set up a business; (v) access to trade finance;
- Involvement of private sector in Public Private Dialogues is key. This is however a challenge since they don't have the resources or time for that. Selecting appropriate PS representatives is also challenging; it is recommended to choose among intermediary institutions like Chambers of Commerce (in LDCs many SMEs are their members), as well as Trade Promotion Agencies (TPOs) and members of National Trade Facilitation Committees.
- Most important is donor beneficiary successful relationship, through: (i) high level support; (ii) designated bodies; (iii) joint vision and shared understanding; (iv) common goal; (v) involvement is continuous rather than from time to time.
- Financing SME development: (i) governments to have enabling environment (e.g. PPPs, appropriate tax laws, PPDs etc.) to better capture donor support; (ii) Multilateral finance institutions have developed instruments to support PS overcome their finance challenges (e.g.

IFC). Upcoming Addis Ababa conference on financing for development should be monitored in this regard.

Day 2: Wednesday 1 July

Parallel side event 9: Business Unusual Post 2015: New Donor Directions in Combining Aid and Trade for Farmers

Organizers: Global Donor Platform for Rural Development

By Rohan Unny Law

Session Main Points:

- Collaboration between public and private sector.
- Canada: (i) Canada's development will also benefit their aid projects; (ii) Cross training between foreign affairs and development aid staff for better fluidity of skills.; (iii) Insertion of Canadian industries into the development sector.
- Australia: (i) Integrated foreign affairs and development or aid sectors in the same manner as Canada; (ii) Domestic subsidies and export subsidies negatively affect global markets through distortions. This hinders progress in developing countries; (iii) Australia wants to conclude Doha and Post Bali; (iv) Supporting WEF initiative Grow Asia; (iv) Agriculture will remain a very prominent part of aid and development program. Facilitation with private sector to better will contribute to the betterment of developing countries.

Parallel Side Event 10: Public Private Dialogue in Supply Chain Management: How to Foster Debate in National Trade Facilitation Committees and Keep this Debate Alive and Kicking

By Julien Grollier

The focus of this side event moderated by Elsbeth Akkerman (Deputy Permanent Representative of The Netherlands to the WTO) was on the scope to use Article 23.2 (National Trade Facilitation Committee) of the WTO Trade Facilitation Agreement to reduce trade costs. The panellists also discussed ways for governments and customs authorities to establish fruitful partnerships with the private sector in areas such as research and innovation, education and training, and development.

The event featured the following speakers: Frank Heijmann (Head of Trade Relations at Customs Administration of the Netherlands); Yao Hua Tan (Professor at Delft University of Technology); Albert Veenstra (Professor at Eindhoven University of Technology and Scientific Director at Dutch Institute for Advanced Logistics); Dennis Heijnen (International Trade Policy Advisor at EVO); and Bram van Helvoirt (Programme Manager Market Intelligence at the Centre for the Promotion of Imports from Developing Countries CBI).

Session's Main Points:

- Partnerships in TF committees: Frank Heijmann talked pointed out that business and customs have interests in common (e.g. need for situational awareness, accurate information), and therefore have an interest to cooperate towards maximizing transparency, facilitating trade etc. The Netherlands has a permanent customs business consultation group which comprises subgroups e.g. on specific topics.
- Partnerships in Research & Innovation: It was pointed out that 40% of delays in main ports are caused by administrative burdens. These could be reduced with more efficient exchange of trade data between businesses and customs and across customs. This would also help reduce fraud risks since these mainly arise from differences between export and import declarations.
- Partnerships in Education & Training: The keyword here was “co creation”, whereby education partnerships with businesses would help them improve compliance with trade regulations. Such education partnerships require developing an understanding of each other’s needs. It was indicated that Delft University offers a Master in Customs & Supply Chain Compliance, built around three pillars: (i) customs regulation; (ii) supply chain management; (iii) information and compliance.

Parallel side event 12: 21st Century Public Private Partnership – A New Model for Implementing the Trade Facilitation Agreement

Organizers: United States of America

By Rohan Unny Law

Session Main Points:

- Emphasis on importance of small businesses. They are the backbone of any economy.
- United Postal Service (UPS) Vice President: (i) Voice for customers in almost 200 different countries; (ii) 12 countries hold 75% of shipments; (iii) Only 9 countries meet best practices; (iv) vested interest in addressing boarder problems.
- DFID: (i) \$260 million committed to trade facilitation. Another \$23 million on its way; (ii) Help bring voice of private sector to policy. This will mean poverty reduction; (iii) Emphasis on alliance.
- Samsung: (i) Many factories around the world thus borders are a concern; (ii) Components moved all over through the value chain approach; (iii) It is clear that unified and standardized customs help business and lower prices; (iii) Productivity and transport need to be streamlined; (iv) Cooperation is needed between government and private sector.
- West African Borders Representative: (i) Wants West Africa without borders; (ii) 80 members came together under the USAID West Africa Initiative; (iii) Mission is to remove barriers to trade and transport, (iv) Corridor streamlining is important; (v) Installation of the border centres to help the process; (vi) Evaluation of practices every 6 months;
- International Chamber of Commerce: (i) TFA would improve competition for developing countries; (ii) Additional revenue from TFA will be sustainable; (iii) Widen access for developing countries; (iv) 50% of costs are sometimes just from transactions; (v) Stumbling blocks in business due to inefficiency in customs or transport or etc; (vi) Small business is often worst affected; (vii) Strong partnership between private sector and government. This means better results for small economies and countries; (viii) Awareness of TFA is sparse among most

multinationals. Even SVEs don't know much about it; (ix) Political will is crucial; (x) TFA will compliment countries trade policies already in place.

Parallel Side Event 15: Regional Infrastructure for Trade Facilitation Impact on Growth and Poverty Reduction

Organized by the ODI at the 5th Global Review of Aid for Trade (30 June – 2 July 2015)

By Sidra Amiri

The session used a Department for International Development (DFID) funded research project led by the Overseas Development Institute (ODI) to discuss evidence around the impact regional infrastructure for trade facilitation has on growth and poverty reduction. Findings showed that improvements in regional infrastructure aimed at trade facilitation in Sub Saharan Africa result directly and indirectly in growth and poverty reduction. There may, however, be specific negative events on groups without complimentary policies. Infrastructure reduces trade costs and thus increases trade. Improving the infrastructure and regional integration also raises growth and productivity, investment, and competition. There are no studies that look at the specific, isolated, effects of regional infrastructure.

Session's Main Points:

- *Dr Marie Agnès Jouanjean Research Fellow, ODI:*
Why is it important to look at Regional integration? (i) Typically, trade is done more with neighbours. (ii) African countries are outward looking, so trading with neighbours in Africa is more difficult. (iii) The nature of the GVC is either regional or global; and depending on which country we are looking at; it is more regional or more global. Example: With Asia, it's a regional value chain. But in most developing countries; it is more of a global value chain. (Example: East Africa) Regional integration provides the greatest importance for land locked countries. And the greatest impediment in these countries to trade is inadequate infrastructure. Regulation impacting competition is included in the infrastructure definition.
- *Professor Olivier Cadot Senior Fellow, Foundation for International Development Study and Research (FERDI) or Director:*
Professor Cadot showed results from research using light data. From a satellite image, regions of a certain country would have spheres of light on them, ranging in size, and depending on the amount of trade and human activity that area has. For example, if an area has a lot of human activity and trade; there would be a big sphere of light, and vice versa. If borders work correctly, there should be no reason to agglomerate activity in those areas. Borders being too stringent, or not regulated properly cause "around the –border activities" to take place; such as, smuggling, agglomeration of population and economic activity around the border. Modern trade doesn't require physical presence, but in many areas in Africa; there is a lot of physical presence around the borders. This needs to change.
- *Dr Ben Shepherd Consultant, Developing Trade*
There is not much quantitative studies on value chains in Sub Saharan Africa (SSA); However, it can be seen that through 1996 to 2011; most of the trading activity in SSA are with the US, Europe and Asia more than regionally with neighbours. Asia is a fast growing trade

partner. SSA is very much involved in value chains; but with US and China. Soft and Hard infrastructure is a strong determinant of value chain connectivity.

- *Frank Mutsaers Chief Executive Officer, TradeMark East Africa (TMEA)*
There needs to be: (i) Improvement of competition at borders; many politicians own trucking companies. (ii) Reduced Exploitation (iii) Simplified Trade Regime (iv) Traders made aware of what they can do at the border; and educated on the processes they can engage in for their own benefit. (v) Development of infrastructure. The risk for the poor is that there are adjustment costs. Compared to land locked countries, coastal countries benefit far more from trade. Thus, landlocked countries need to trade with their coastal neighbours more. It is important to diversify exports and export strategies for land locked countries.
- *Gerald Makau Masila Executive Director, Eastern Africa Grain Council*
Infrastructure in terms of warehouses is important to discuss: East Africa Grain Council does some work in this area, they: Get farmers into cooperatives, put their produce into certified warehouses and turn the stuff at the warehouses into collateral. As collateral, there is assurance for banks to invest, and we eliminate the need to sell all the produce immediately. East Africa faces some challenges with the warehouses: (i) Availability of suitable warehouses in private sector hands. (ii) Expertise in commodity care, and quantity care. (This is somewhat addressed through training, but what is being done at the moment is still not enough)(iii) Harmonizing region's standards; domesticating, utilizing, and implementing the standards are still needed. So far, all of the EAC countries have demonstrated and harmonized their standards; however they are yet to fully implement them.
There are challenges facing EAC in implementing the standards: (i) Low awareness of standards (ii) Testing and grading facilities, labs, and infrastructure are adequate or missing. (iii) There are gaps in standards the big question is: What is the impact to smallholders? There are few warehouses, (i.e. 10 in Kenya, 10 in Uganda, and 5 in Tanzania) the warehouses allow smallholders banking and getting produce out into the market more efficiently. Smallholders can also access markets they previously were not able to. They can get better prices. Farmer groups are formed. Warehouses allow smallholders to access credit; 5 million Kenyan shillings lent to smallholders by banks as a result of warehouses.
Harmonization of standards allows smallholders to work harder to meet the standards in place. As a result, they can gain access to a wider range of, more profitable, and even global markets. Recommendations: (i) Scaling up and accelerating the process of getting smallholders into warehouses, and groups. (ii) Continue working on infrastructure (iii) Training and capacity building
- *Prof Jaime de Melo Senior Fellow, Foundation for International Development Study and Research (FERDI)*
Trade leads to growth, and not the other way around. 10x increase in trade is due to reducing trade costs Improving hard infrastructure is what is usually implied when talking about infrastructure in general. However, although it does reduce costs and increase development, improving hard infrastructure doesn't mean that soft infrastructure is improved too. Soft infrastructure proves to be very crucial to development. Trade facilitation agreement is important for land locked countries.
- *Questions and comments by the Audience:*
What is the ODI doing to help with the movement of goods across borders? (ii) Why is Africa not trading within itself? Is it because of infrastructure? (iii) Africa does trade within Africa; it is just not measured. What are the comments of the panellists on services and IT infrastructure? What is the impact of improving infrastructure at borders? (iv) Trade is not being adequately captured.

- Responses or Conclusion
Ben: Africa trades within Africa, but no formal data is collected for that and you still find Africa below potential than with its neighbours. It's hard to find data on regional value chains because of market fragmentation, and policy impediments.
Frank: Why Africa doesn't trade with itself is contextual. Reducing cost of leasing containers is important.

Parallel Side event 16: The Future of EU Aid for Trade strategy – A Stakeholder Consultation

Organizers: EU and EU Member States

Rohan Unny Law

Session's Main Points:

- EU strategy: (i) quantitative ambitions (remain a major donor, increase overall aid) (ii) enhanced pro poor focus and quality (strong ownership of recipient countries and intervention strategies based on needs assessment) (iii) EU and MS capacity in line with aid effectiveness demand driven. (iv) ACP specific angle: regional integration processes and EPAs (50% of TRA increase ACP) (v) Monitoring, reporting and evaluation.
- EU is dissatisfied with LDC proportion of aid for trade (lower than others like LMICs, etc.) Overall AfT has been positive.
- Aligning AfT with concrete poverty reduction is difficult and complex.
- Engage the private sector.
- LDCs per capita get \$10 (3x as much as LMICs).
- GVC creates better chances for industrialization.
- Focus on reducing trade costs – link the poor to all markets.
- ODA grants, etc. are good way of doing this.
- Incentivize regional approaches.
- Don't make a trust fund for every problem you come across.
- On the basis of ownership, let the country decide.
- New approaches
- Context specific poverty reduction. Global approach is difficult.
- QFDF etc. is old lingo. Action focused agenda is probably better in today's day and age.
- Improving trade info transparency: (i) Trade map, market access map and investment map. (ii) Export potential map (iii) Trade obstacles alert. (iv) Non tariff measures surveys and capacity building.
- Questions from the floor:
 - (i) It seems to be about competitive interests rather than solid development and human betterment? (ii) Can we have ODA on one end and Aid for Trade on the other?

Answers:

Invest in high value jobs and sectors to improve lives in Africa. Emphasis on the emergence of services. Agro, manuf., services. Get higher value from the services sector. Align AFT to the continental frameworks for Africa. Trade is important but not an end, a means. Connectivity and integration of institutions is also important. Production capacity as well as trade facilitation.

Parallel Side Event 19: Lowering Trade Costs by Mapping Sustainability Standards in Supply Chains

Organized by the 5th Global Review of Aid for Trade (30 June – 2 July 2015)

Sidra Amiri

Session's Main Points:

Sustainable standards help facilitate compliance with public standards, improve product quality, market access, market production and financing through various channels. However, for SMEs, compliancy with standards proves to be a challenge and creates more obstacles and trade costs, as opposed to lowering barriers or reducing costs. The Standards Map of ITC's Trade for the European Commission tries to tackle this challenge by providing information on sustainability standards that is transparent.

To view the standards map: www.standardsmap.org

For a brochure on this session by the ITC:

https://ororwww.wto.org/orenglish/ortratop_eor/level_eora4t_eorglobal_review15prog_eorsideevents19_e.htm

- *Dominik Ziller, Deputy Director General for International Development Policy, BMZ, Germany.* Sustainability standards provide transparency, credible data on standards, thus companies may see more opportunity to invest in goods that meet such standards.
- *Dorothy Tembo, Deputy Executive, Director, ITC* Sustainable development is important for everyone, and it is growing. Sustainable standards are more challenging. Non trade barriers (NTBs) are the real issue.
- *Juan Carlos Ardila, Managing Director, Cafexport Colombia* Certification schemes help coffee farmers in Columbia in a few ways: To improve their living conditions. Sustainability measures have mitigated social and environmental impacts. We need to go beyond the farm. Certifications are for those who want and can. We need to improve training and raise awareness about these standards and how to get them. There needs to be a generational transition in the coffee producing sector. Many of the coffee producers in South America are near the age of retirement, and their children typically are not interested in taking over their business. There is more supply than demand of certified products. Farmers are attracted to certifications because of the premiums. The premiums should be invested in structural transformation
- *Antonia Wanner, Head of Global, Commodity Procurement, Nestlé* VSS is a key driver for sustainability. Standard Map allows for action "The upgrade of our practices allowed reducing accidents and reducing absences" – Quote from supplier in Mexico
- *Puvan Selvanathan, Head of the UNGC Food and Agriculture Business Principles (FABs) programme, UNGC*

Common language between actors in the sustainability in food systems is needed; can we agree on what “healthy” means? The private sector needs to complement the role of NGOs in their “Business Principles.” The UNGC FAB Principles: (i) Establish global ‘blue numbers’ and ‘big data’ platform. (ii) Use this data to deliver tailored capacity building together with governments. Our three functions: Issue global identity, Put codes (blue numbers) side by side for comparison. Blue numbers also overcome involuntary standards, Make certification data shareable, and transparent. We need to have the whole system mapped; link all the ministries (Business, Agriculture, and Trade) to the farmers and banks.

Parallel side event 20: Understanding Effective Development Partnerships Cooperative Experiences with Developing Countries or LDCs

Organizers: Joint Chinese Taipei World Vision

Rohan Unny Law

Speaker’s Main Points:

- Swaziland:
Swaziland is an LMIC. Taipei is a huge development partner. They are very grateful. Kinds of aid from Taiwan: Trade related infrastructure. Productive capacity building. Other trade related support.
- Swaziland constructed a new airport recently.
- Swaziland is grateful for Taiwanese funded university scholarship program.
- World Vision: Is trade the end, or the path to sustainable development? Increasing poverty, conflict, disaster, etc. juxtaposed with The Aid for Trade review on the idyllic Lake Geneva. Emphasis on education. This promotes better livelihoods in the future. Aid for Trade in many places requires a base capacity that many countries lack. Neither Doha nor other development programs are focusing on the wrong sectors or ideas. Locked into existing paradigms, status quos, etc. still reign. We need a new outlook and approach. Aid for Trade focuses on private sector benefits to a great extent. Needs to be benefit bottom up not vice versa.

Parallel Side Event 21: Promoting Cooperative to Cooperative Trade for Sustainable Development

Organized jointly by the Centre for Socio Eco Nomic Development, International Labour Organization and Benin for the 5th Global Review Aid for Trade (June 30—July 2)

Sidra Amiri

Speakers Main Points:

- *Aly Khan Jamal: Expert Advisor, Dalberg Global Development Advisors*
One of the key barriers to agricultural trade between cooperative is financial insurance. Producer cooperatives need to compete with non cooperatives. This will require overcoming multiple impediments throughout the value chain identified by interviewees; many of those

barriers are rooted in capacity gaps of producer corporations. Some barriers include: Meeting specifications, lack of processing, pace of decision making, difficulty in managing trading and shipping. Significant markets in North America, EU, Asia, could be promising due to international trade for cooperatives.

- *Prof. Saner: Director, CSEND & Diplomacy Dialogue*
Cooperatives are a separate entity in terms of principle. All developed countries have a stable part of their economy in cooperatives. If they're important; why don't we have any statistics? We need more quantitative research on cooperatives. Emphasis on all government agreed to bring about sustainability in environment, social and economic development. LDC's, landlocked countries, and small island states have a strong informal economy. Cooperatives can contribute to SDGs because they can focus on: sustainable economic development, social sustainability, social integration. We need to collect data on cooperatives.
- *Rodrigo Gouveia: Policy Director, ICA*
Why coops? They are based on values, fair trade, etc. Best for fair trade involvement. Principles Coops operate on: (i) Membership—open and voluntary (You can own your own business). (ii) Democratically controlled by members. (iii) Economic Participation. (iv) Cooperation among cooperatives; makes them stronger. The people that own cooperatives are the ones who benefit.
Revenue generated by coops stay in the community of people who generated it. Unlike in investments, where they leave to their investors. When you do business established in Benin or Uganda; the revenue generated will stay there. The top ten countries in COOP trade correlate to the Top 12 countries in social development in the world. This is not a coincidence. Concern for the community is a key feature of cooperatives. For example, in China; the farmers needed credit but no one would give small credit to small farmers in China. Their cooperatives, however, replied to that need because these farmers were members.
- *Sergi Corbalan: Executive Director of Fair Trade Advocacy Office*
One of the things that underpin cooperatives is their ethical nature. During financial crises, cooperatives tend to be more stable. Consumer cooperatives are the best retailers for fair trade. Specific example: Cafédirect: Farmers get price, premium goes to cooperatives. The cooperatives are the most obvious way smallholders can get recognized. Profits of trade can be invested in cooperatives. Let's have differentiated strategies; four main recommendations: Empower small producers in supply chains, Create an Enabling environment, Adapt trade and trade related policies, Make offer meet fair trade demand.
- *Zhang:*
China has low cost because they produce in linkage quantities. Advantages in Cooperatives: Diversity of ICA members in different countries allows cooperative advantage and lower transaction cost and lower risk.
- *Question and Answers or Conclusion:*
The question and answers session was brief and raised an interesting point on the issue of governability. Cooperatives have a democratic governing system, and with the scenario of having 1 exporting company and 30 cooperatives, governing can be a challenge. The panel responded by saying that there is a paper on cooperative governance in the Global Conference in November with guidelines to address these issues.

Day 3: Thursday, 2 July

Parallel Side event 25: Transforming Border Bottlenecks into Global Gateways OECD Tools to Support Trade Facilitation

Organizers: OECD

Rohan Unny Law

Speaker's Main Points:

- OECD has a regulatory database.
- Web tools are available for trade facilitation database. Compare your country.orgortrade facilitation: Provides comparison to other countries and best practices. Can see the evolution of trade facilitation over time. An excellent quantitative tool.
- Policy change simulator: Simulate a policy change. See value for all elements that compose each indicator. More info: evdokia.moise@oecd.org
- Aid for Trade facilitation database: Compare where trade is from and where it goes. Detailed breakdown and statistics available for visual data for even deeper study and analysis. Data are updated annually.
- DHL: Private sector can benefit from these tools as well. All will be able to focus and pinpoint issues.
- USAID: Concrete data is extremely important. Data is powerful and can make change effective and lasting. The message of raw data and predictions can incite political will. Feedback from policy change come from databases and are good ways of pinpointing weakness and shortcomings.

Parallel Side Event 27: Barriers facing women traders in Africa: What are they and how could Aid for Trade help in Removing Them?

Leslie Debornes

Speaker's Main Points:

- Why should we focus on women? HR perspective and economic argument: high productivity, high involvement of the population, equality in trade.
- Swedish new govt: feminist foreign policy (new govt, last year). What means? Still working on. Gender issues are going to be integrated in all we do (including trade issues). When it comes to T is something we are working on for a long time and discussion on the climate – quite obvious.
- Submission to DG, in the next global review: gender as the next overall theme. Several seminars on this global review: good signal.

- Women and trade in Africa: realizing the potential (Paul Brenton, World Bank) –
- See the report. Evident based piece of work looking at how realizing T potential: gender issue key element for Africa to realize the potential. High involvement of women in T: cross border traders, producers of goods, manage export firms through entrepreneurs.
- Addressing the issues that women face to realize aft trade potential. N
- Contribution of women in trade is overlooked by policy makers: Lack of data (gender disaggregated data) or not to see small scale trade as illicit or illegal trade even if not taken into account in the formal economy;; Lack of analysis of constraints and challenges to develop their business and lack of representation in the policy making process
- Implementation of TFA, how do we ensure gender constraints addressed? Lack of transparency and awareness of the rules (difficult to read for a lot of women, difficulty to get the required information or permit etc. , access to market information is a problem, Difficulty to access trade and networks, often control by men. By intermediary, that cost extra cost. Poor condition and harassment when crossing the border
- We have developed charter for trade rights and obligations
- Great length finalization project (infrastructure investment, supporting implementation at the border, training, efficient performance and management) UG RW and DRC. first WB project that will focus on small traders (major of them are women)
- UNCTAD, Joakim Reiter: dignity cannot be achieved for everyone if we forget 50% of the population. Huge untapped potential (economically) if we don't look at women participation or potential in the economy.
- Relationship btw trade and gender: trade is a source of empowerment for women. By trade being an engine for transformation you transform your society, create looser and winner. Critical that countries analyse from the point of view of gender effect when developing T policies.
- Make to have a multistakeholder approach to implement T policy.
- Gender mainstream into ICT, in the services sector (access to the financial market), macroeconomic policies (fiscal policies to be gender sensitive)
- Impact of trade policies or what do we mean by open trade, where do we need to react in addition of general trade policy measures and AfT.
- ITC, Dorothy: pt of view of making it happens for the women. Need additional efforts being made, frameworks have been put in place: are they effected? Are they implemented? COMESA has had a broad gender framework, but translation into practical and understandable steps are lacking. No discussion on gender related aspect in COMESA or SADEC we are looking at large companies, not where the business was when you look critically at the numbers. Implement special instruments put in place that recognize small players that are critically important.
- Making the dialogue inclusive and increase the awareness, special recognition that it is not a homogenous group. Ways of communication and information sharing that are adapted
- Institutional mechanisms to be put in place – ensure there is a consistent and up to date input of the necessary issues within the mech or org that will make the change happen (government, dvt partners, implementing agencies). more coordination
- ITC important in the making it happen. Our value comes in from the pt of view of working with SMEs on their competitiveness and regional dimension. Try to provide integrated solutions to answer to specific issues at national level, always taking into aspect the gender aspect.

- Implementation of women platforms (exporters, producers, non exporters, etc.). Collaborative work with the EIF, UG as country test.
- Side, Marie Ottosson – Integrating gender equality in dvt cooperation: strategic areas for improvements in Sida work is WEE and female traders. Look at Sida’s model for gender mainstreaming: important document for them Legal aspects include policy: women not allowed to own land; difficult to open bank accounts; difficult to obtain documents required from foreign or cross border trade; Once you have the good legal framework, how you practically implement it: changed norms; men’s involvement; female traders have more limited time for their business, less educated, less access to trade networks, less access to trade intelligence; lack of appropriate infrastructure at the border
- Do a specific needs assessments or gender perspective for all projects that have accepted: mandatory plenary discussions:
- The issue of government procurement: monitoring the enforcement of what has been decided, in the guidelines of the ministry of finance in each country. Critical monitoring on this issue, able to assess the women has been giving the opportunity you try to create.
- UNCTAD cabinet training in developing countries, not working in silos. Increase collaboration between the different org working on trade and gender is critical, agriculture also ...

List of CUTS Reporting Staff

Julien Grollier: Project Officer, jg@cuts.org

Leslie Debornes: Assistant Programme Officer, ldb@cuts.org

Rohan Unny Law: Intern, rohanunnylaw@hotmail.com

Sidra Amiri: Intern, sidra.amiri@euruni.edu

Work on organic farming, UNCTAD do so. Policies, standards requirements, etc. go beyond with biodiversity trade (UNCTAD).

An area where there is a huge untapped potential, profit margin if you achieve to access the market or the financing or the protection of this trade.

CUTS International is a nongovernmental think and action tank working on Trade, Regulations and Governance. Website: www.cuts.citee.org

